NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

NEW YORK STATE SUPREME COURT **ERIE COUNTY** -----X Index No.: ____/___ TERRENCE TRAINA, Date Filed: November 6, 2019 **SUMMONS** Plaintiff, -against-Plaintiff designates Erie County as the place of trial. BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA and GREATER NIAGARA FRONTIER COUNCIL, The basis of venue is one Defendants. defendant's residence. **Child Victims Act Proceeding** 22 NYCRR 202.72

TO THE ABOVE NAMED DEFENDANTS:

YOU ARE HEREBY SUMMONED to answer the complaint in this action and to serve a copy of your answer, or, if the complaint is not served with this summons, to serve a notice of appearance, on the Plaintiff's attorneys within 20 days after the service of this summons, exclusive of the day of service (or within 30 days after the service is complete if this summons is not personally delivered to you within the State of New York); and in case of your failure to appear or answer, judgment will be taken against you by default for the relief demanded in the complaint.

Dated: November 6, 2019

Respectfully Yours,

MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC

James K. Marsh

By

151 East Post Road, Suite 102 White Plains, NY 10601-5210

Phone: 929-232-3235 jamesmarsh@marsh.law

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

Jennifer Freeman 151 East Post Road, Suite 102 White Plains, NY 10601-5210 Phone: 929-232-3128 jenniferfreeman@marsh.law

Robert Y. Lewis 151 East Post Road, Suite 102 White Plains, NY 10601-5210 Phone: 646-306-2145

robertlewis@marsh.law

PFAU COCHRAN VERTETIS AMALA PLLC

Michael T. Pfau 403 Columbia St.

Suite 500

Seattle, WA 98104 Phone: 206-462-4335 michael@pcvalaw.com Pro hac vice forthcoming

Jason P. Amala 403 Columbia St. Suite 500 Seattle, WA 98104 Phone: 206-462-4339 jason@pcvalaw.com Pro hac vice forthcoming

Anelga Doumanian 31 Hudson Yards 11th Floor Suite 36 New York, NY 10001 Phone: 206-330-0215 adoumanian@pcvalaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

NEW YORK STATE SUPREME COURT ERIE COUNTY		
TERRENCE TRAINA,	X	Index No.:/
	Plaintiff,	COMPLAINT
-against-		
BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA and GREATER NIAGARA FRONTIER COUNCIL,		Child Victims Act Proceeding 22 NYCRR 202.72
Defendants.		

Plaintiff, by and through his attorneys, the Marsh Law Firm PLLC and Pfau Cochran Vertetis Amala PLLC, respectfully alleges for his complaint the following:

I. INTRODUCTION

- 1. Starting in the early 1900s, the Boy Scouts of America ("BSA") knew that its Scout leaders, volunteers, and members were using their positions to groom and to sexually abuse children. By 1935, the Chief Scout Executive of the BSA told the New York Times that almost 1,000 men had already been removed from Scouting because they "undertake to deal with sex matters and become morbid on the subject and sometimes give way to temptation and develop practices which make them degenerates."
- 2. The BSA refers to its internal files on such men as its "perversion" files. Since that 1935 report in the New York Times, the BSA has tried to keep the "perversion" files a secret. Even worse, for many years the BSA had a policy of destroying "perversion" files even though the files could have helped the BSA understand how so many sexual predators were able to use its Scouting program to groom and to sexually abuse children.
- 3. The BSA has largely succeeded in keeping the "perversion" files hidden from the public, including Scouts and their parents. While not much is known about the files after 1985, the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

files that were not destroyed show that the BSA created at least 1,123 "perversion" files between

1965 and 1985 – an average of more than one new "perversion" file a week.

4. While the sheer number of Scout leaders who have been accused of molesting

children is striking, particularly given the large percentage that either pled guilty or were found

guilty, the number of their victims is overwhelming. Many of the files reflect Scout leaders who

allegedly abused multiple children, sometimes more than twenty or thirty children.

5. The BSA refuses to voluntarily release the rest of its "perversion" files, but its own

liability expert in another case testified that the files from 1944 through 2016 contain the names

of 7,819 Scout leaders and volunteers who have been accused of child sexual abuse. If each

accused Scout leader and volunteer abused five children, which is likely a conservative number,

the total number of their victims would be close to 40,000.

6. Despite decades of knowledge that its Scouting program was a magnet for child

molesters, the BSA failed to take reasonable steps to protect children from being sexually abused.

7. Even worse, the BSA actively concealed the widespread sexual abuse of young

boys that occurred as a direct result of its supposedly "safe" program and "trustworthy" Scout

leaders and volunteers. For example, in 1972, the Boy Scout Executive who oversaw the

"perversion" files asked the other Scout Executives to keep the files confidential "because of the

misunderstandings which could develop" if the public learned of the files.

8. Based on the BSA's wrongful conduct, a reasonable person could and would

conclude that it knowingly and recklessly disregarded the abuse of children and chose to protect

its reputation and wealth over those who deserved protection. The result is not surprising: for

decades thousands of children were sexually abused by Boy Scout leaders, volunteers, and

2

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

members. The Plaintiff in this lawsuit is one of the children who was sexually abused because of

the BSA's wrongful conduct.

II. PROCEEDING IN ACCORDANCE WITH CPLR 214-G AND 22 NYCRR 202.72

9. This complaint is filed pursuant to the Child Victims Act (CVA) 2019 Sess. Law

News of N.Y. Ch. 11 (S. 2440), CPLR 214-G, and 22 NVCRR 202.72. The CVA opened a historic

one-year one-time window for victims and survivors of childhood sexual abuse in the State of New

York to pursue lapsed claims. Prior to the passage of the CVA, Plaintiff's claims were time-barred

the day he turned 22 years old. The enactment of the CVA allows Plaintiff, for the first time in his

life, to pursue restorative justice in New York State.

III. PARTIES

10. Upon information and belief, the BSA is a Texas corporation authorized to do

business in New York with its principal office in Irving, Texas.

11. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA conducted business as

the "Boy Scouts of America" or the "Boy Scouts."

12. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA authorized local councils

and local organizations to charter, sponsor, and operate Boy Scout Troops, Cub Scout Troops, and

other types of Troops throughout New York, including Plaintiff's troop.

13. The BSA, the local councils, and the local organizations would collectively select

the leaders and volunteers of each Boy Scout Troop and Cub Scout Troop in New York, including

the leaders and volunteers of Plaintiff's Troop.

14. However, the BSA retained and exercised the ultimate authority to decide who

could be a leader or volunteer of any Boy Scout Troop or Cub Scout Troop, including the leaders

and volunteers of Plaintiff's Troop when he was sexually abused.

3

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

15. The BSA also had the right to control the means and manner of the staffing,

operation, and oversight of any Boy Scout Troop, Cub Scout Troop, or other type of Troop,

including Plaintiff's Troop, when Plaintiff was sexually abused.

16. In exchange for BSA's name, programming, and endorsement, the leaders,

volunteers, and members of every Boy Scout Troop, Cub Scout Troop, or other Troop affiliated

with the BSA in the United States, including New York, would pay the BSA an annual membership

fee, including the leaders, volunteers, and members of Plaintiff's Troop when he was sexually

abused.

17. In exchange for the opportunity to participate in the BSA's programming and

activities, the child members of every Boy Scout Troop, Cub Scout Troop, and other Troop

affiliated with the BSA in the United States, including those in New York, would pay the BSA an

annual membership fee, including Plaintiff when he was a child member.

18. Plaintiff Terrence Traina ("Plaintiff") is an adult male who currently resides in

North Tonawanda, New York.

19. Upon information and belief, Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr. ("Moll") was

a Boy Scout leader or volunteer that the BSA used and relied upon as a Scout leader or volunteer

to serve the Boy Scouts in Plaintiff's Boy Scout Troop.

20. During the time that Moll served as a Boy Scout leader or volunteer for the BSA,

he used his position as a Boy Scout leader or volunteer to groom and to sexually abuse Plaintiff.

21. To the extent that the BSA was a different entity, corporation, or organization

during the period of time in which Moll used his position as a Boy Scout leader or volunteer to

sexually abuse Plaintiff, such entity, corporation, or organization is hereby on notice that it is

intended to be a defendant in this lawsuit.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

22. To the extent the BSA is a successor to a different entity, corporation, or organization which existed during the period of time during which Moll used his position as a Boy Scout leader or volunteer to sexually abuse Plaintiff, such predecessor entity, corporation, or organization is hereby on notice that it is intended to be a defendant in this lawsuit.

- All such BSA-related entities, corporations, or organizations are collectively 23. referred to herein as the "BSA."
- 24. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times defendant the Greater Niagara Frontier Council, Boy Scouts of America ("Greater Niagara Council"), was a New York corporation organized under New York law that transacted business in Erie County.
- 25. Upon information and belief, the Greater Niagara Council is currently a corporation organized under New York law with its principal office in Buffalo, New York.
- Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council was 26. a local council of the BSA that acted as an agent of the BSA as to the Boy Scout Troops, Cub Scout Troops, and other Troops under its jurisdiction within the BSA, including Plaintiff's Troop when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr.
- 27. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council conducted business as the "Greater Niagara Frontier Council" and the "Greater Niagara Council."
- 28. Upon information and belief, Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr. was a Boy Scout leader or volunteer that the Greater Niagara Council used and relied upon as a Scout leader or volunteer to serve the Boy Scouts in Plaintiff's Boy Scout Troop.
- 29. During the time that Moll served as a Boy Scout leader or volunteer for the Greater Niagara Council, he used his position as a Boy Scout leader or volunteer to groom and to sexually abuse Plaintiff.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

30. To the extent that the Greater Niagara Council was a different entity, corporation,

or organization during the period of time in which Moll used his position as a Boy Scout leader to

sexually abuse Plaintiff, such entity, corporation, or organization is hereby on notice that it is

intended to be a defendant in this lawsuit.

31. To the extent the Greater Niagara Council is a successor to a different entity,

corporation, or organization which existed during the period of time during which Moll used his

position to sexually abuse Plaintiff, such predecessor entity, corporation, or organization is hereby

on notice that it is intended to be a defendant in this lawsuit.

32. All such Greater Niagara Council-related entities, corporations, or organizations

are collectively referred to herein as the "Greater Niagara Council."

33. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA and the Greater Niagara

Council owned and operated Camp Scouthaven Boy Scout Camp, among other properties in and

around Buffalo, New York, and they hired, supervised, and retained the staff, leaders, and

volunteers who operated, coordinated, and supervised the camps.

34. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council used the

camp to promote and benefit their Scouting program, including during the times that Plaintiff

attended the camp and was sexually abused at the camp, and both defendants generated revenue

from the camp operations, including fees paid by Plaintiff and his family so he could attend the

camp and participate in its activities.

IV. VENUE

35. Venue is proper because the Greater Niagara Council is a domestic corporation

authorized to transact business in New York with its principal office located in Buffalo, New York.

6

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

36. Venue is proper because Erie is the county in which a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to Plaintiff's claim occurred.

37. Venue is proper because Plaintiff currently resides in North Tonawanda, New York.

> V. STATEMENT OF FACTS

38. Plaintiff Terrence Traina repeats and re-alleges the allegations regarding the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council from the "Introduction" and the "Parties" sections, above, including the fact that the BSA knew for decades that Scout leaders and volunteers were using

their positions to groom and to sexually abuse children throughout New York.

39. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA, its agents, servants, and

employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Greater Niagara Council, including

the Boy Scout Troops, Cub Scout Troops, and other Troops in the geographic area that the BSA

assigned to the Greater Niagara Council.

40. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA, its agents, servants, and

employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Greater Niagara Council, and held

out to the public its agents, servants, and employees as those who managed, maintained, operated,

and controlled the Greater Niagara Council.

41. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA was responsible for the

hiring and staffing, and did the hiring and staffing, for many of the leadership positions of the

Greater Niagara Council, including those positions that were responsible for ensuring that Plaintiff

and other children who participated in Scouting activities were protected from the danger of child

sexual abuse.

42. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA was responsible for and

did the recruitment and staffing of volunteers for the Greater Niagara Council, including those

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

positions that were responsible for ensuring that Plaintiff and other children who participated in

Scouting activities were protected from the danger of child sexual abuse.

43. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA controlled the policies

and procedures of the Greater Niagara Council, including any policies and procedures regarding

the danger of Scouts being sexually abused by Scout leaders or volunteers and how to protect

children from that danger.

44. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA held itself out to the

public as the owner of the Greater Niagara Council.

45. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA materially benefited

from the operation of the Greater Niagara Council, including the services of Assistant Scoutmaster

Robert Moll, Jr. and the services of those who managed and supervised Moll.

46. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA, its agents, servants, and

employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff

belonged to when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr., including its

leaders and volunteers.

47. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the BSA, its agents, servants, and

employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff

belonged to when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr., including its

policies and procedures regarding the sexual abuse of children.

48. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council, its

agents, servants, and employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Boy Scout

Troops, Cub Scout Troops, and other Troops in the geographic area of New York that it was

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

assigned by the BSA, including the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he was

sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr.

49. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council, its

agents, servants, and employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Boy Scout

Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert

Moll, Jr., and held out to the public its agents, servants, and employees as those who managed it,

maintained it, operated it, and controlled it.

50. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council was

responsible for the hiring and staffing, and did the hiring and staffing, for many of the leadership

positions of the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he was sexually abused by

Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr.

Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council was 51.

responsible for the recruitment and staffing of volunteers for the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff

belonged to when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr.

52. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council held

itself out to the public as the owner of the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he was

sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr.

53. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council

materially benefited from the operation of the Boy Scout Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he

was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr., including the services of Moll and

the services of those who managed and supervised Moll.

54. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council, its

agents, servants, and employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Boy Scout

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert

Moll, Jr., including its leaders and volunteers.

55. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times the Greater Niagara Council, its

agents, servants, and employees managed, maintained, operated, and controlled the Boy Scout

Troop that Plaintiff belonged to when he was sexually abused by Assistant Scoutmaster Robert

Moll, Jr., including its policies and procedures regarding the sexual abuse of children.

56. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times Moll was an Assistant

Scoutmaster of the BSA.

57. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times Moll was on the staff of, acted as

an agent of, or served as an employee or volunteer of the BSA.

58. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times Moll was acting in the course and

scope of his position with the BSA.

59. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times Moll was an Assistant

Scoutmaster of the Greater Niagara Council.

60. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times Moll was on the staff of, was an

agent of, or served as an employee or volunteer of the Greater Niagara Council.

61. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times Moll was acting in the course and

scope of his position with the Greater Niagara Council.

62. When Plaintiff was a minor, he registered with the BSA and the Greater Niagara

Council and paid them a fee to participate as a member of one of their Boy Scout Troops and to

go on their camping trips.

63. At all relevant times, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their agents,

servants, and employees, held Moll out to the public, to Plaintiff, and to his parents, as their agent.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

64. At all relevant times, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their agents, servants, and employees, held Moll out to the public, to Plaintiff, and to his parents, as having been

vetted, screened, and approved by those defendants.

At all relevant times, Plaintiff and his parents reasonably relied upon the acts and 65.

representations of the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their agents, servants, and employees,

and reasonably believed that Moll was an agent of those defendants who was vetted, screened, and

approved by those defendants.

At all relevant times, Plaintiff and his parents trusted Moll because the BSA and 66.

the Greater Niagara Council held him out as someone who was safe and could be trusted with the

supervision, care, custody, and control of Plaintiff.

67. At all relevant times, Plaintiff and his parents believed that the BSA and the Greater

Niagara Council would exercise such care as would a parent of ordinary prudence in comparable

circumstances when those defendants assumed supervision, care, custody, and control of Plaintiff.

68. When Plaintiff was a minor, Assistant Scoutmaster Robert Moll, Jr. sexually abused

him when Moll was his Assistant Scoutmaster.

Plaintiff was sexually abused by Moll when Plaintiff was approximately 13 to 14 69.

years old.

70. Based on the representations of the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council that Moll

was safe and trustworthy, Plaintiff and his parents allowed Plaintiff to be under the supervision of,

and in the care, custody, and control of, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, including during

the times when Plaintiff was sexually abused by Moll.

71. Based on the representations of the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council that Moll

was safe and trustworthy, Plaintiff and his parents allowed Plaintiff to be under the supervision of,

NYSCEF DOC NO 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

and in the care, custody, and control of, Moll, including during the times when Plaintiff was

sexually abused by Moll.

72. Neither Plaintiff nor his parents would have allowed him to be under the

supervision of, or in the care, custody, or control of, the BSA, the Greater Niagara Council, or

Moll if the BSA or the Greater Niagara Council had disclosed to Plaintiff or his parents that Moll

was not safe and was not trustworthy, and that he in fact posed a danger to Plaintiff in that Moll

was likely to sexually abuse Plaintiff.

73. Neither Plaintiff nor his parents would have paid the BSA or the Greater Niagara

Council to allow him to be a member of their Boy Scout Troop if the BSA or the Greater Niagara

Council had disclosed to Plaintiff or his parents that Moll was not safe and was not trustworthy,

and that he in fact posed a danger to Plaintiff in that Moll was likely to sexually abuse Plaintiff.

74. Neither Plaintiff nor his parents would have paid the BSA or the Greater Niagara

Council to allow him to be a member of their Boy Scout Troop if the BSA or the Greater Niagara

Council had disclosed to Plaintiff or his parents that the BSA knew for decades that hundreds or

thousands of sexual predators, like Moll, were using their position as a Scout leader or volunteer

to groom and to sexually abuse children.

75. No parent of ordinary prudence in comparable circumstances would have allowed

Plaintiff to be under the supervision of, or in the care, custody, or control of, the BSA, the Greater

Niagara Council, or Moll if the BSA or the Greater Niagara Council had disclosed to Plaintiff or

his parents that Moll was not safe and was not trustworthy, and that he in fact posed a danger to

Plaintiff in that Moll was likely to sexually abuse him.

76. In approximately 1974, Moll exploited the trust and authority vested in him by the

BSA and the Greater Niagara Council by grooming Plaintiff to gain his trust and to obtain control

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

over him as part of Moll's plan to sexually molest and abuse Plaintiff and other children, including those who participated in the Scouting program offered by the BSA and the Greater Niagara

Council.

SCEF DOC. NO. 1

77. Moll used his position of trust and authority as an Assistant Scoutmaster of the BSA and of the Greater Niagara Council to groom Plaintiff and to sexually abuse him multiple times, including when Plaintiff was under the supervision of, and in the care, custody, or control of, the

BSA, the Greater Niagara Council, and Moll.

78. At certain times, Moll's sexual abuse of Plaintiff occurred during Scouting activities that were sponsored by, or were a direct result of Scouting activities sponsored by, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, including Scout camping trips on properties owned by the defendants in and around Buffalo, New York, such as Camp Scouthaven.

79. Upon information and belief, prior to the times mentioned herein, Moll was a known sexual abuser of children.

80. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times, defendants, their agents, servants, and employees, knew or should have known that Moll was a known sexual abuser of children.

- 81. Upon information and belief, at all relevant times, it was reasonably foreseeable to defendants, their agents, servants, and employees that Moll's sexual abuse of children would likely result in injury to others, including the sexual abuse of Plaintiff and other children by Moll.
- 82. Upon information and belief, the defendants, their agents, servants, and employees knew or should have known that Moll was sexually abusing Plaintiff and other Scouts.
- 83. Upon information and belief, defendants, their agents, servants, and employees knew or should have known that the sexual abuse by Moll of Plaintiff was ongoing.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

84. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, knew or should have known before and during Moll's sexual

abuse of Plaintiff that Scout leaders, volunteers, and other persons serving the BSA and the Greater

Niagara Council had used their positions with those defendants to groom and to sexually abuse

children.

85. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, knew or should have known before and during Moll's sexual

abuse of Plaintiff that such Scout leaders, volunteers, and other persons could not be "cured"

through treatment or counseling.

86. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, concealed the sexual abuse of children by Moll in order to conceal

their own bad acts in failing to protect children from him, to protect their reputation, and to prevent

victims of such sexual abuse by him and other Scout leaders and volunteers from coming forward

during the extremely limited statute of limitations prior to the enactment of the CVA, despite

knowing that Moll and other abusers in their ranks would continue to molest children.

87. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, consciously and recklessly disregarded their knowledge that Moll

would use his position with the defendants to sexually abuse children, including Plaintiff.

88. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, disregarded their knowledge that Moll would use his position

with them to sexually abuse children, including Plaintiff.

89. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, acted in concert with each other or with Moll to conceal the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

danger that Moll posed to children, including Plaintiff, so that Moll could continue serving them

despite their knowledge of that danger.

90. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, knew that their negligent, reckless, and outrageous conduct would

inflict severe emotional and psychological distress, as well as personal physical injury, on others,

including Plaintiff, and he did in fact suffer severe emotional and psychological distress and

personal physical injury as a result of their wrongful conduct.

91. Upon information and belief, the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council, their

agents, servants, and employees, concealed the sexual abuse of children by Scout leaders,

volunteers, and other persons serving the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council in order to conceal

their own bad acts in failing to protect children from being abused, to protect their reputation, and

to prevent victims of such sexual abuse from coming forward during the extremely limited statute

of limitations prior to the enactment of the CVA, despite knowing that those Scout leaders,

volunteers, and other persons would continue to molest children.

92. By reason of the wrongful acts of the BSA and the Greater Niagara Council as

detailed herein, Plaintiff sustained physical and psychological injuries, including but not limited

to, severe emotional and psychological distress, humiliation, fright, dissociation, anger,

depression, anxiety, family turmoil and loss of faith, a severe shock to his nervous system, physical

pain and mental anguish, and emotional and psychological damage, and, upon information and

belief, some or all of these injuries are of a permanent and lasting nature, and Plaintiff has and/or

will become obligated to expend sums of money for treatment.

15

SCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

VI. CAUSES OF ACTION

Α. FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION – NEGLIGENCE

93. Plaintiff Terrence Traina repeats and re-alleges all of his allegations above and

below.

94. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council had a duty to take reasonable steps to

protect Plaintiff, a child, from foreseeable harm when he was under their supervision and in their

care, custody, and control.

95. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council also had a duty to take reasonable steps

to prevent Moll from using the tasks, premises, and instrumentalities of his position as an Assistant

Scoutmaster with the defendants to target, groom, and sexually abuse children, including Plaintiff.

96. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council were supervising Plaintiff, and had care,

custody, and control of Plaintiff, when he was a paying member of their Boy Scout Troop or

participarting in their Scouting activities, during which time those defendants had a duty to take

reasonable steps to protect him, including Scout camping trips on properties owned by the

defendants in and around Buffalo, New York, such as Camp Scouthaven.

97. These circumstances created a special relationship between the BSA and Plaintiff,

and between the Greater Niagara Council and Plaintiff, which imposed on each of those defendants

a duty to exercise the degree of care of a parent of ordinary prudence in comparable circumstances.

98. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council breached each of the foregoing duties

by failing to exercise reasonable care to prevent Moll from harming Plaintiff, including sexually

abusing him.

99. In breaching their duties, including hiring, retaining, and failing to supervise Moll,

giving him access to children, entrusting their tasks, premises, and instrumentalities to him, failing

16

NYSCEE DOC NO 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

to train their personnel in the signs of sexual predation and to protect children from sexual abuse

and other harm, failing to warn Plaintiff, his parents, and other parents of the danger of sexual

abuse, and failing to create a safe and secure environment for Plaintiff and other children who were

under their supervision and in their care, custody, and control, the BSA and the Greater Niagara

Council acted willfully and with conscious disregard for the need to protect Plaintiff. The BSA

and the Greater Niagara Council through their actions and inactions created an environment that

placed Plaintiff in danger of unreasonable risks of harm under the circumstances.

100. It was reasonably foreseeable that defendants' breach of these duties of care would

result in the sexual abuse of Plaintiff.

101. As a direct and proximate result of the acts and omissions of the BSA and the

Greater Niagara Council, Moll groomed and sexually abused Plaintiff, which has caused Plaintiff

to suffer general and special damages as more fully described herein.

B. SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION – OUTRAGE AND INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS

102. Plaintiff Terrence Traina repeats and re-alleges all of his allegations above and

below.

103. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council engaged in reckless, extreme, and

outrageous conduct by providing Moll with access to children, including Plaintiff, despite knowing

that he would likely use his position to groom and to sexually abuse them, including Plaintiff.

Their misconduct was so shocking and outrageous that it exceeds the reasonable bounds of

decency as measured by what the average member of the community would tolerate and

demonstrates an utter disregard by them of the consequences that would follow.

104. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council engaged in reckless, extreme, and

outrageous conduct by representing to Plaintiff and his family that Moll was safe and trustworthy,

17

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

and that all Scout leaders and volunteers were safe and trustworthy, despite the fact that these

defendants knew that sexual predators, like Moll, were using their positions in Scouting to groom

and to sexually abuse children. Their misconduct was so shocking and outrageous that it exceeds

the reasonable bounds of decency as measured by what the average member of the community

would tolerate and demonstrates an utter disregard by them of the consequences that would follow.

105. As a result of this reckless, extreme, and outrageous conduct, Moll used his position

with the defendant to gain access to Plaintiff and to sexually abuse him.

106. The BSA and the Greater Niagara Council knew that this reckless, extreme, and

outrageous conduct would inflict severe emotional and psychological distress, including personal

physical injury, on others, and Plaintiff did in fact suffer severe emotional and psychological

distress and personal physical injury as a result, including severe mental anguish, humiliation and

emotional and physical distress.

VII. CPLR 1603 – NO APPORTIONMENT OF LIABILITY

107. Pursuant to CPLR 1603, the foregoing causes of action are exempt from the

operation of CPLR 1601 by reason of one or more of the exemptions provided in CPLR 1602,

including but not limited to, CPLR 1602(2), CPLR 1602(5), 1602(7) and 1602(11), thus precluding

defendants from limiting their liability by apportioning some portion of liability to any joint

tortfeasor.

VIII. PRAYER FOR RELIEF

108. Plaintiff demands judgment against the defendants named in his causes of action,

together with compensatory and punitive damages to be determined at trial, and the interest, cost

and disbursements pursuant to his causes of action, and such other and further relief as the Court

deems just and proper.

18

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

109. Plaintiff specifically reserves the right to pursue additional causes of action, other than those outlined above, that are supported by the facts pleaded or that may be supported by other facts learned in discovery.

Dated: November 6, 2019

Respectfully Yours,

MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC

James R. Marsh

151 East Post Road, Suite 102 White Plains, NY 10601-5210

Phone: 929-232-3235 jamesmarsh@marsh.law

Jennifer Freeman 151 East Post Road, Suite 102 White Plains, NY 10601-5210 Phone: 929-232-3235

jenniferfreeman@marsh.law

Robert Y. Lewis 151 East Post Road, Suite 102 White Plains, NY 10601-5210

Phone: 646-306-2145 robertlewis@marsh.law

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 1

INDEX NO. 814696/2019

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 11/06/2019

PFAU COCHRAN VERTETIS AMALA PLLC

Michael T. Pfau 403 Columbia St.

Suite 500

Seattle, WA 98104

Phone: 206-462-4335 michael@pcvalaw.com Pro hac vice forthcoming

Jason P. Amala 403 Columbia St. Suite 500 Seattle, WA 98104 Phone: 206-462-4339 jason@pcvalaw.com Pro hac vice forthcoming

Anelga Doumanian
31 Hudson Yards
11th Floor Suite 36
New York, NY 10001
Phone: 206-330-0215
adoumanian@pcvalaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff